

own reflection – and central also to the purpose of the centre he outlines – is the question of memory-sharing as a *process*. This is not the seemingly singular production of shared memorial practices, but rather a more dynamic process in which the various memorial traditions of France, the Caribbean, South America, the Indian Ocean and West Africa are brought into relationship with each other without any conflation or attempt to impose general commemorative practices.⁴⁷ It is important to note that the centre he proposes in *Mémoires des esclavages* is posited therefore not as a 'lamentarium' (i.e. a place of introspective mourning), but as a site of exchange.

In an article published in May 2008, the third annual commemoration of slavery and its abolition in metropolitan France, Glissant expressed his frustration that with the arrival of the Sarkozy government, with its hostility to the largely invented enemy of 'colonial repentance', the plans for the centre that he had outlined in his publication the previous year seemed to have been shelved.⁴⁸ Glissant proposed instead – through his Institut du Tout-monde – to establish an alternative memorial practice, more marginal to official commemoration. It would be, in his terms, both *nomadic* and *diffracted*: nomadic as a result of the generalized impact of slavery as a historical and contemporary phenomenon as well as of the transnational memorial processes with which it is increasingly associated; and diffracted because, although memories are not identical and although they change in direction and intensity, there is nevertheless a need, in Glissant's own terms, to bring them into 'relation' with each other. This more recent text joins many previous voices in openly challenging official, Franco-centric models of commemoration. At the same time, it outlines the possibility of an approach to remembering slavery that will, as the opening epigraphs to this chapter suggest, both recognize and encourage the 'spontaneous evocation' of plural, entangled, coexisting memories.

8 PUBLIC MEMORY OF SLAVERY IN BRAZIL

Ana Lucia Araújo

During the period of the Atlantic slave trade, Brazil imported more than five million enslaved Africans, the largest number of all the Americas.¹ In 1888, Brazil was also the last country in the American continent to abolish slavery. Since the end of slavery, the majority of the descendants of Africans deported to Brazil remained economically and socially excluded. In the last thirty years, however, the denunciation of social and racial inequalities and the fight against racism have significantly increased. The growing visibility of Afro-Brazilian demands for civil rights have led to the development of different forms of cultural assertion, in which Africa occupies the central place.

In Brazil, as in the rest of the Americas, Europe and Africa, emerging initiatives highlighting the memory of slavery in public space have largely resulted from the political struggle of actors seeking social justice.² Through Carnival, dance, music, visual arts and religion, Afro-Brazilian groups have promoted the connections between Brazil and Africa. However, even in state capitals with large populations of African descent, such as Salvador and Rio de Janeiro, the Brazilian slave past has remained concealed in the public space. Although the politics and memory of slavery have been increasingly visible in the international arena since at least the early 1990s, Brazilian initiatives commemorating and memorializing slavery in the public arena have been comparatively recent. By examining the existing monuments and museums commemorating slavery in Brazil, this chapter contends that there have been considerable obstacles in creating permanent places dedicated to the public memory of slavery in the country. First, the absence of monuments and museums dedicated to slavery indicates how difficult it has been for the nation to deal with its slave past, as most individuals of African descent, which today constitute more than 50 per cent of the total Brazilian population, still occupy the lower ranks of Brazilian society. On the other hand, Afro-Brazilians do not wish to be constantly associated with a negative image of victimhood, embodying the tragedy experienced by their African ancestors.

The first section of this chapter presents a brief overview of Brazilian slavery and its abolition, the racial inequalities that followed abolition during the

twentieth century and the fight against racism. Through the analysis of some existing initiatives in various Brazilian cities, the second section discusses how memories of slavery remained confined in the private sphere and concealed in Brazilian public space. The chapter then goes on to examine the impact of the international rise of public memories of slavery in Brazil and discusses how slavery gradually started gaining visibility in public space.

Slavery and its Aftermath

The majority of enslaved Africans who arrived in Brazil through its largest slave ports such as Rio de Janeiro and Salvador (Bahia) embarked in the coastal areas of West Central Africa and West Africa. Slavery was widespread across Brazilian territory, with the largest enslaved population concentrated in the north-east and the south-east where the plantation and mining regions were located. In addition, slave labour was employed not only in the sugar, coffee, cotton, cattle and gold industries but also in the urban areas where enslaved men and women performed myriad tasks, such as street vendors, domestic labourers, cooks, porters, barbers, blacksmiths, tailors, bricklayers and gardeners. Whereas high death rates and low levels of natural reproduction characterized the dynamics of the enslaved population living in the rural areas, manumissions (either granted or self-purchased) predominated in the urban areas. The combination of these factors and the sustained demand for slave labour led Luso-Brazilian slave owners to continuously import new Africans.³

In 1808, following the abolition of the British slave trade and the transfer of the Portuguese court who left Lisbon for Rio de Janeiro in order to escape the invasion of Napoleon Bonaparte, British influence in Brazilian affairs dramatically increased. The Strangford treaty of 1810 established exceptionally favourable conditions for imported British goods. Britain started a long and intense campaign to abolish the Luso-Brazilian slave trade: in 1815, the Anglo-Portuguese treaty established that the slave trade from West Africa was illegal. Eventually, the slave trade to Brazil was outlawed in 1831, when the nation was already independent from Portugal. However, the illegal slave trade continued until the passing of the Law Eusébio de Queirós in 1850, which officially prohibited Brazil from importing enslaved Africans, even though records indicate illegal slave trade activity in the following few years.⁴

In 1888, Brazil was the last country in the Americas to abolish slavery. Abolition of slavery consisted of a long process involving various factors. Enslaved men and women fought against slavery by running away, creating fugitive slave communities, organizing rebellions and purchasing the freedom of their relatives and themselves. When slavery was finally outlawed, the Brazilian state did not provide land, employment or education to the newly emancipated men and

women. In the rural areas, most former slaves continued working for their former masters for little or no wages, whereas others moved to urban areas in search of better living conditions and work opportunities.⁵

From the second half of the nineteenth century, Brazilian intellectual and economic elites increasingly advocated whitening policies. Based on eugenic arguments, the idea of whitening aimed to slowly eliminate the African component of the Brazilian population.⁶ As a result, the monarchy and the rural elites encouraged the immigration of an Italian, Spanish, Portuguese and German workforce in order to gradually replace the slave workforce of the São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro coffee plantations. From 1884 to 1893, almost one million European immigrants arrived in Brazil. Although European immigration contributed to an increase in the country's white and mixed population, whitening policies were not successful.⁷

The whitening policies and the myth of the three races – emphasizing that Brazil was formed by the balanced contribution of three human groups (indigenous, Europeans and Africans) – which had emerged in the first half of the nineteenth century, helped to promote the idea that Brazilian society was essentially mixed and characterized by harmonious racial relations.⁸ During the 1940s, these ideas of racial mixture and racial harmony were conveyed through the term 'racial democracy', an ideology that basically denied the existence of racism and racial inequalities.⁹ In the 1950s, the image of Brazil as a 'racial laboratory' or a 'laboratory of civilization' was disseminated abroad, especially through the work of Brazilian physician and anthropologist Arthur Ramos (1903–49), who in 1949 became the director of the Department of Social Sciences of UNESCO. In this same year, the fourth session of the General Conference of UNESCO approved a major initiative to fight racism and in 1950 the fifth session of UNESCO's General Conference approved a study of racial relations in Brazil.¹⁰ Just a few years after the Holocaust, in a period when racism and segregation persisted in the United States and had become state doctrine in South Africa, UNESCO's aim was to explain how Brazil succeeded in producing racial harmony. Eventually, the monographs produced by scholars who participated in the UNESCO study, including Florestan Fernandes, Roger Bastide, Harry W. Hutchinson and Charles Wagley concluded that despite the appearance of racial tolerance Brazil was a country marked by the existence of racial and social inequalities instead of harmonious racial relations.¹¹

The debates on racial relations initiated in the 1950s intensified in the 1960s. During the military regime (1964–85) the idea of racial democracy was gradually transformed into an ideology of the Brazilian state. In the 1960s, Florestan Fernandes was the first Brazilian scholar who systematically criticized racial democracy, influencing subsequent studies on racial relations.¹² Nowadays, despite the growing number of studies on racial relations developed by Brazilian

scholars and the Afro-Brazilians' struggle against racism, the myth of three races and the ideology of racial democracy remain fully alive in Brazil. However, the end of the military dictatorship in 1985 and the commemoration of the centenary of the abolition of slavery in Brazil in 1988 contributed to the emergence of important initiatives aiming to fight racial inequalities and to make the memory of slavery and the roles of Afro-Brazilian historical actors visible in public space.¹³

Since the 1990s, affirmative action has become a crucial element in the fight against racism led by Brazilian black organizations. On 20 November 1995, the tricentenary of the death of Zumbi, leader of the *Palmares quilombo*, was widely celebrated. Since then, the Brazilian black movement has replaced the commemoration of 13 May, the day of the passing of the 'Golden Law' abolishing slavery, with the commemoration of 20 November, which in 2003 officially became National Black Consciousness Day.

Slavery in Brazilian Public Memory

Among the enslaved persons who survived the hardships of slavery, recollections of the period of slavery were often scarce and usually remained among the members of their family, restricted to the private sphere. In those groups in which the chain of transmission was not totally disrupted, personal memories and memories of small groups remained alive in various instances, including Afro-Brazilian religions such as Candomblé and cultural traditions, such as dance and music.¹⁴

Although in Brazil African heritage is deeply intertwined with the material and immaterial heritage of slavery, the valorization of African culture is a recent trend, which is part of the international rise of the public memory of slavery in Europe, Africa and other countries of the Americas of the last twenty years. Initiatives promoting African heritage in the Americas and slavery sites in Africa are very often associated with the development of tourist initiatives that have been receiving increasing support from international agencies such as UNESCO, especially through the Slave Route project launched in 1994.¹⁵ In the public context, memory is not simply an issue of transmission, it influences how different groups (including governments, official agencies and NGOs) with particular political and economic interests fight to appropriate the public space. This appropriation can take different forms; this chapter focuses especially on monuments, memorials and museums.

Today Afro-Brazilians make up the majority of the Brazilian population. However, since the colonial period their presence has constantly been neglected in official public written and visual narratives. Except in the works of foreign artists who started visiting Brazil in the seventeenth century, enslaved black women and men were not very often portrayed in Academy painting and until the end of the nineteenth century they barely appeared in literary works.¹⁶ The abolition

of slavery did not change this picture. Although urbanization and the emergence of a modernist movement in visual arts and literature introduced representations of black individuals, following the rise of the whitening theory, the *mestiço* (mixed-race person) became the symbol of the Brazilian nation, concealing and diluting black presence in favour of the idea, or rather an ideology, of celebrating *mestiçagem* (racial mixture). Consequently, until the end of the twentieth century slavery – with very few exceptions including the monument to the Mãe Preta (Black Mother) unveiled in São Paulo in 1955 and the Museu do Negro (Black Museum) created in Rio de Janeiro in 1960 – Afro-Brazilians remained excluded from official public and permanent sites of memory, including monuments and museums.¹⁷

The ideology of *mestiçagem* was also visible in history textbooks, where slavery and the Atlantic slave trade were concealed and where Afro-Brazilians were not presented as a specific group but as only as part of an imagined mixed biological and cultural unity. Reinforcing this tendency, there was no clear discussion of why and how blacks migrated to Brazil. The long history of slavery was briefly presented within the framework of 'labour'. Essentially, the abolitionist fight was not emphasized. The main historical actor of the abolition of slavery in Brazil was not a black individual, but the redeemer Princess Isabel (1846–1921), who signed the Golden Law abolishing slavery on 13 May 1888. Over the twentieth century, all of these elements combined with the ideologies of *mestiçagem* and racial democracy greatly contributed to obscure the presence of Afro-Brazilian historical figures in the public sphere. However, as explained in the following sections, this situation of invisibility started to slowly change during the second half of the twentieth century. In massive nation-wide celebrations like Carnival – a festival in which the Afro-Brazilian population traditionally participated – including Rio de Janeiro samba school parades, slavery was a topic commonly conveyed.¹⁸ Despite the visibility of slavery in Brazilian Carnival, until the 1980s, very few official initiatives highlighted slavery and Afro-Brazilian historical actors in public space.

Slavery in Carnival

During the twentieth century Brazilian Carnival was among the exceptional occasions when Afro-Brazilian historical actors were celebrated in the public arena, especially in the early 1930s, when the government of Getúlio Vargas transformed Rio de Janeiro Carnival parades into an official competition.¹⁹ From the beginning of the 1960s, when the public started paying to attend the parades, the themes of each *escola de samba* became more sophisticated. In fact, by examining the lyrics and themes developed by Rio de Janeiro samba schools since the end of the 1950s, it is apparent that most Carnival parades featured

slavery themes. Founded in 1953, the *escola* Acadêmicos do Salgueiro started featuring slave past and the history of Afro-Brazilians. In 1957, Salgueiro's main theme was *Navio Negreiro* (Slave Ship).²⁰ In 1960, Salgueiro staged the history of Palmares quilombo, Brazil's most important runaway slave community. By exalting the trajectory of Zumbi of Palmares, the school subverted the official history of Brazil, which emphasized neither the resistance against slavery, nor the important role of Afro-Brazilian historical actors. In 1963, the main theme of Salgueiro was Chica da Silva, the infamous eighteenth-century Brazilian-born freed woman who lived in the city of Diamantina, in the state of Minas Gerais.²¹ Chica da Silva's trajectory is linked to a particular trait of the eighteenth-century mining society, in which enslaved women living in the urban areas could be freed, especially through self-purchase.²² The samba explains how Chica transcended her social condition by becoming the lover of José Fernandes de Oliveira, a rich diamond-mine owner, who freed and married her, transforming her into a powerful mixed-race woman of Minas Gerais slave society.

In 1964, the school staged the history of Chico Rei, another mythical character of Afro-Brazilian history. According to the legend and the lyrics of Salgueiro's samba, Chico was born in the Kingdom of Congo. In the beginning of the eighteenth century, he and his family were captured and sold to the slave traders who brought him to Brazil. According to the myth, he was sent to Minas Gerais where he not only purchased his freedom, but also that of his fellow slaves. In popular memory, Chico Rei is usually identified as the king of the processions performed by the Catholic brotherhood of Santa Efigênia of the Church of Nossa Senhora do Rosário in Vila Rica (modern Ouro Preto, in the state of Minas Gerais), the city where Chico is said to have lived. Despite the lack of historical evidence confirming the existence of Chico Rei, his memory was preserved through the public festivals organized by this brotherhood and transmitted throughout the twentieth century. The popularity of the character is visible in Ouro Preto, where a former gold mine was named after him and became a tourist site which today is opened to visitors. The entrepreneurs of this initiative claim that it was the actual mine allegedly owned by Chico Rei.

During the 1970s, the parades of Rio de Janeiro samba schools became an even more privileged place to convey the public memory of slavery because Brazilian television began broadcasting the parades. In 1976, Salgueiro honoured enslaved Africans brought to Brazil in the samba *Valongo*, the name of an important slave wharf and slave market in the city of Rio de Janeiro. In 1978, Salgueiro's samba *Do Yorubá à luz, a aurora dos deuses* (From Yoruba to the light, the dawn of gods) explained the origin of the Candomblé *orixás* (deities). According to the lyrics, enslaved Africans sent to Brazil, were 'kings, heroes and Yoruba gods'.²³ This same year, the *escola de samba* Beija-Flor de Nilópolis, presented the theme *A criação do mundo na tradição nago* (The world's creation in

the Nago tradition). In the samba lyrics, the three African princesses Iyá Kalá, Iyá Detá and Iyá Nassô tell the story of the world's creation by Obatalá.

From the mid-1970s, Carnival also started gaining the attention of the mass media in Bahia. A new positive black identity, in connection with the African-American movement for civil rights, emerged in Bahia, where new Carnival and cultural groups such as Ilê Ayiê, Olodum, Malê Debalê and Timbalada publicly asserted their blackness through the promotion of Afro-Brazilian culture. During Bahian Carnival, these blocs often chose for their parades themes underlining slave resistance in Brazil.²⁴

Slave resistance and a new approach criticizing the ineffectiveness of Brazilian abolition were also visible in the parades of the 1980s. In 1988 Brazil commemorated the centenary of the abolition of slavery. The *escola de samba* Mangueira presented the samba *Cem anos de liberdade, realidade e ilusão* (One hundred years of freedom, reality and illusion). At a time when the transition to democracy was still unfinished, the lyrics questioned the effectiveness of the abolition of slavery. Unlike the previous Salgueiro sambas celebrating the abolition of slavery, these lyrics introduced a new vision of Afro-Brazilian history. According to this version, supported by the emergent black movements, the Golden Law did not put an end to slavery as Afro-Brazilians continued to live in poverty.²⁵ This change in the samba lyrics can also be perceived the following year. In 1989, Salgueiro's samba *Templo negro em tempo de consciência negra* (Black temple in a time of black consciousness) not only recalled Afro-Brazilian historical actors celebrated in the last twenty years, but also exalted black beauty.

From the end of the 1950s until the end of the 1980s, Carnival was one of the only occasions when slavery appeared in the public arena. However, during this period, following the growing visibility of the Brazilian black movement, the way slavery was depicted in Carnival parades changed. The early idealized and celebratory representations of the abolition of slavery, seen as a gift given by Princess Isabel, were slowly replaced with representations of Afro-Brazilian historical actors who fought slavery or successfully gained their freedom. Despite these changes, in other important areas of Brazilian popular culture, like television, idealized representations of slavery continued to predominate.

Slavery in Brazilian *Telenovelas*

Since the 1950s, the Brazilian public memory of slavery has also been influenced by movie and television productions. One of the first Brazilian films featuring the period of slavery is *Sinhá Moça* (1953). The film was appraised in important international competitions, including a special mention at the Venice Film Festival (1954) and the Silver Bear at the Berlin International Film Festival. Despite dealing with the period of the end of slavery in Brazil and the numerous slave

escapes that characterized it, the film focused on the benevolent white woman, daughter of a great slave owner, who started promoting abolitionist ideals.

Since the 1960s, the filmmaker Carlos Diegues – a member of the movement Cinema Novo (New Cinema of Brazil) that created films featuring Brazilian social problems – has brought slavery and slave resistance to the big screen. Unlike *Sinhá Moça*, Diegues's films *Ganga Zumba* (1963), *Xica da Silva* (1976) and *Quilombo* (1984) focused on Afro-Brazilian characters that freed themselves from slavery or fought against it.

However, Cinema Novo films were not accessible to the majority of the Brazilian population who essentially watched television and in particular *telenovelas*, an important product of Brazilian mass culture. As most early Brazilian *telenovelas* were set in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, they had a great impact on the way slavery had been remembered in Brazil. In *telenovelas* like *A Cabana do Pai Tomás* (1969) (based on the North American novel *Uncle Tom's Cabin* (1852)), the character of Pai Tomás was played by Sérgio Cardoso, a white actor in blackface. The same issue was also present in another popular Brazilian *telenovela*, *A Escrava Isaura* (1976) ('The Slave Isaura'), produced by the Globo television network. One year before the broadcasting of the North American television series *Roots*, based on the novel of the same name by Alex Haley, *A Escrava Isaura* was Brazil's first television production focusing directly on slavery. Based on the nineteenth-century abolitionist novel of the same name by Bernardo Guimarães, this *telenovela* had a great impact on the construction of a public memory of slavery in Brazil.²⁶ However, the actress who played the role of the main slave character was a white actress whose physical features were clearly distinct from the other black slave characters. By presenting the enslaved heroine as a white woman, Globo not only denied a central role to an Afro-Brazilian actress but also led the audience to mistakenly assume that there were enslaved whites in Brazil. The contrast between the white enslaved woman and the other slave characters was not only due to physical features. Isaura was represented as a passive and docile slave – characteristics that helped the audience to identify with her – whereas the other black slave characters were represented as rude, malicious and stupid. Moreover, Isaura, in contrast to the other black slaves, was able to read and write in Portuguese and even in French, abilities that were very difficult to find among the Brazilian enslaved population, especially in the rural areas. The end of the *telenovela* presented the abolition of slavery as a gift granted by the generous white master. *A Escrava Isaura* was re-screened several times over the following decades. It was a huge success not only in Brazil but also in another eighty countries. In 2004, Record Television Network produced a second version of *A Escrava Isaura* with a white actress, Bianca Rinaldi, in the protagonist's role. The opening credits of both versions of this soap opera featured an animation conceived with Jean-Baptiste Debrer's watercolours representing Rio

de Janeiro nineteenth-century slave life.²⁷ By watching the *telenovela's* opening, national and international audiences became familiar with Debrer's representations of slavery. Despite containing several accurate elements, these watercolours also contributed to a particular image of Brazilian slavery which alternated idealized representations of enslaved men and women with representations featuring physical punishments, still largely reproduced and perceived as realistic today.

Slavery as Material and Immaterial Heritage

As in other former slave societies, Brazil is socially, economically and culturally marked by the legacies of slavery. In the former sugar plantations of the north-east or in the former coffee plantations of the south-east the material heritage of slavery is still perceivable in the remaining buildings of the old *casas-grandes* (masters' houses) and *senzalas* (slave quarters) and in the various built structures where sugarcane and coffee beans were transformed and stored. Even though the Brazilian slave past is visible everywhere, including the *fazendas* (estates) of Rio Grande do Sul, the former coffee plantations of the Paraíba Valley and the former slave ports such as Salvador, Recife and Rio de Janeiro, very few heritage or touristic initiatives focus on this slave past. Despite the recent increasing number of monuments and initiatives highlighting Afro-Brazilian history, projects aimed at developing cultural tourism on sites related to slavery remain incipient and scattered. In the Paraíba Valley, some former coffee plantations have been restored and transformed into hotels. In the Fazenda Ponte Alta (Barra do Piraí, Rio de Janeiro), the original slave quarters have been preserved. The Fazenda Santa Clara (Valença, Rio de Janeiro), one of the largest coffee producers in the region, which held 2,800 slaves, is visited by hundreds of tourists each year. However, these privately owned initiatives do not aim to emphasize the slave past of the region and are still perceived as rural tourism.

Both in the rural and urban areas, the immaterial heritage of slavery remains alive among the numerous *quilombola* communities, gathering the descendants of former enslaved individuals. As in the past, these communities convey the memory and the heritage of slavery in 'a cultural process that engages with acts of remembering that work to create ways to understand and engage with the present'.²⁸ *Quilombola* communities make 'use of the past, including both its interpretation and representation', through Candomblé and Catholic ceremonies and festivals, music and dance performances like *jongo*, the practice of 'playing stick' or in martial arts such as capoeira.²⁹ However it is important to remember that Candomblé and capoeira were extensively repressed by the Brazilian state until the end of the 1950s and continued to be marginalized and ascribed to the poor Afro-Brazilian population during the second half of the twentieth century. Indeed, most of these Afro-Brazilian traditions embodying

the memory of slavery were visible in the public sphere only in specific places and during particular periods of the year, such as Carnival and religious festivals and ceremonies.³⁰

If foreign scholars such as Melville Herskovits, Roger Bastide, Ruth Landes and Pierre Verger, as well as some Brazilian anthropologists and sociologists such as Edison Carneiro, Nina Rodrigues, Arthur Ramos and Gilberto Freyre paid great attention to Afro-Brazilian culture, Brazilian historians largely neglected the memories of enslaved men and women. It was only in the 1980s – influenced by the commemorative activities associated with the centenary of the abolition of slavery – when most former slaves were already deceased, that some historians became interested in systematically collecting oral histories preserved by the descendants of slaves.³¹

Slavery in Monuments and Museums

The struggle of Afro-Brazilian organized groups to make the memory of slavery visible in public spaces was a long process that gained importance during the 1960s, but was drastically interrupted by the military coup in 1964. In the 1980s, with the decline of the military regime and the first democratic elections for governor, senator and deputies at the federal and state levels held in 1982, Brazilian black activists, such as Abdias Nascimento, were elected to the National Congress. As a deputy between 1983 and 1987, Nascimento was a pioneer, not only in proposing a law to make the date of the anniversary of Zumbi's death a national holiday, but also by proposing a second project to create a memorial to the unknown slave at Praça dos Três Poderes in Brasília. Although these two projects were never approved, their proposal indicates that by the early 1980s the public memory of slavery was already a concern for the Brazilian black movement.

Until very recently, then, Brazil had few public monuments commemorating slavery. The first monument honouring Zumbi, the leader of Palmares *quilombo*, was unveiled in 1986. The bronze statue is a replica of a head from the Kingdom of Benin displayed in the British Museum and is located in the central square of Presidente Vargas Avenue in Rio de Janeiro.³² Despite the protests of black activists, in May 2003, during the celebration of the 115th anniversary of the Golden Law abolishing slavery, a bronze statue representing Princess Isabel was unveiled in Rio de Janeiro. Unlike the Zumbi bust, located downtown, the statue was placed on the Avenue Princesa Isabel in Copacabana, close to the beach, in a middle-class residential neighbourhood. The statue, created by the sculptor Edgard Duvivier represents the redeemer Princess Isabel holding a pen, implying that the abolition of slavery was not the result of several centuries of abolitionist struggle, but a gift granted by the royal heiress.

Other monuments celebrating Zumbi were erected across a number of Brazilian cities during the first decade of the twenty-first century. In 2002 a full-body statue of Zumbi was unveiled in the downtown area of Duque de Caxias, in the state of Rio de Janeiro. In May 2009, also in Rio de Janeiro, a bust of Zumbi was unveiled in Petrópolis. In the same state, monuments in cities such as Volta Redonda, Búzios, Três Rios and Campo Grande honoured Zumbi. All over the country, squares were named for Zumbi in cities such as Araras in São Paulo and Curitiba in Paraná. Brasília, the capital of the country, also has a square named Zumbi with a bust of the *quilombo* leader. The plaque at the base of the monument reads 'Zumbi, the black leader of all races'.³³ In Brasília, on 21 March 1997, the name of Zumbi was also added to the Book of National Heroes, a steel book containing the names of several Brazilian male historical figures, located at the monument Panteão da Pátria e da Liberdade Tancredo Neves [Tancredo Neves Pantheon of Homeland and Freedom], unveiled at Praça dos Três Poderes in 1986.³⁴

The city of Salvador, which has the largest population of African descent in Brazil, did not unveil any notable public monument focusing on its slave past until the twenty-first century. Instead the city chose to highlight its connections with Africa without necessarily emphasizing slavery and the Atlantic slave trade. In the historic city centre, there is not a single plaque associating the numerous buildings and squares to any activity related to slavery and the slave trade. Even in 1985, when UNESCO added Salvador's historic centre (including a square known as 'Pelourinho', where slaves were publicly punished) to the World Heritage List, the decision was based essentially on the colonial characteristics of its architecture. Although this decision was taken some years prior to the 1994 inauguration of the UNESCO Slave Route project, the International Council of Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) report on Salvador did not even mention the word 'slavery' but rather compared the city to other Latin American slave ports by underscoring its colonial past and position as a crossroad of cultures.³⁵

In November 2004, however, four busts were unveiled at Praça da Piedade in Salvador to honour the four leaders of the 1798 Tailors' Conspiracy who fought to abolish slavery and who were condemned to death one year later. At the base of the busts of Manuel Faustino dos Santos Lira (1775–99), the freedman Lucas Dantas do Amorim Torres (1774–99) and the freemen Luiz Gonzaga das Virgens e Veiga (1762–99) and João de Deus do Nascimento (1771–99), there is a plaque containing a short biography of each martyr and a paragraph that reads: 'Martyr of the revolutionary movement of 1798, entitled "Cowries Conspiracy", "Tailors' Revolt", or "Tailors' Conspiracy", he defended the cause of the independence of Brazil, the proclamation of the Republic, the abolition of slavery and equal rights to all citizens.'³⁶

On 30 May 2008 Salvador unveiled its first monument commemorating Zumbi, more than twenty years after Rio de Janeiro. Bahia's black movement was

not so well organized as in Rio de Janeiro, where it had the support of the Democratic Labour Party. The monument was the result of a joint initiative of the Palmares Cultural Foundation, the NGO A Mulherada, an organization for the defence of black women's rights, the Minister of Culture (at the time, Gilberto Gil), and the municipality of Salvador. A public contest chose the sculpture honouring Zumbi, which would be placed at Praça da Sé, in Salvador's historic centre. The artist Lázaro Souza Duarte won the contest and was awarded the amount of £11,500. The full-body bronze statue on a granite square base represents Zumbi as a warrior holding a spear. On the base of the sculpture, the text inscribed on two plaques recalls Afro-Brazilians' fight for freedom:

Zumbi of Palmares, leader of the country's first democratic experiment. The monument to Zumbi of Palmares is the symbol of the resistance of Brazilian black people and the materialization of the memory of fights and conquests by the exercise of freedom and the strengthening of black consciousness.³⁷

Zumbi dos Palmares. The time has come to take away our nation from the darkness of racial injustice. Born free in 1655, in the Mountain of Barriga, Union of Palmares, Alagoas. Grandson of Aqualtune, he did not allow his people to be subjugated by the Portuguese Crown, because he wanted freedom for all, within and outside the quilombo. He continued the fight and became the quilombo's leader, and was hurt in 1694, when the capital of Palmares was destroyed. On November 20, 1695, he was killed and decapitated. After 300 years, the date of the death of this leader of the black resistance was established by the black movement as National Black Consciousness Day.³⁸

The monument and the two texts accompanying it show an important shift in the narrative of Brazilian slavery. The emphasis and the popularization of the image of Zumbi, a warrior who fought against slavery, helped to transform the image of the enslaved in Brazil. Presented in the past as passive victims, enslaved men and women are now displayed as powerful fighters.

On 15 November 2007, Minister of Culture Gilberto Gil unveiled the Memorial Park of Palmares Quilombo, the most important initiative promoting a historical site associated with the resistance against slavery. The park is located near the city of União dos Palmares, at Serra da Barriga, in the state of Alagoas, situated in a region close to the *quilombo's* original location. The process that resulted in the creation of this park started in 1980, when the federal government recognized the zone as a historic monument. On 21 March 1988, the year of the centenary of the abolition of slavery in Brazil, a federal decree officially established the site as a national monument. The construction of the country's first Afro-Brazilian cultural theme park received the support of the Palmares Foundation, the Ministry of Culture, the Ministry of Tourism, Petrobrás, Caixa Econômica Federal and the Special Secretariat of Policies of Racial Equality Promotion (SEPPIR). A total of £800,000 was invested. The various structures in the park occupy an area of 33,000 square feet in a 692-acre site. It comprises a

complete structure to receive tourists, including a visitors' centre, various belvederes, a replica of Zumbi's house and indigenous huts.

Although several museums (especially in Bahia and Rio de Janeiro) are partially or entirely dedicated to African arts, religions and traditions, to date a museum specifically dedicated to slavery has not yet been created in Brazil. In 2004 the Museu AfroBrasil was founded in the city of São Paulo to promote African arts, culture and heritage. Despite providing information on slavery from the point of view of the Afro-Brazilian population, the museum's curator Emanuel Araújo refused to make slavery the central aspect of the museum.³⁹

Many other public and private museums all over the country contain objects and sometimes one or two rooms dedicated to slavery.⁴⁰ However, the topic is almost never directly addressed. The Atlantic slave trade frequently appears under the topic of 'trade' and slavery is almost always referred to as being part of the general colonial context of 'labour'. The permanent exhibitions presented in these institutions do not provide any detailed account of the Luso-Brazilian slave trade and slavery and do not explain the past and present consequences of slavery in Brazil. Instead most of the exhibitions display nineteenth-century European iconography, most of which was produced by Jean-Baptiste Debret, depicting Brazilian slave daily life, especially physical punishments. The Museu Júlio de Castilhos in Rio Grande do Sul, among others, displays instruments used to torture enslaved men and women. Although these objects and images inform the visitor that slavery was an important institution in the state, and not only in more well-known Brazilian states such as Bahia and Rio de Janeiro, they reduce the image of Afro-Brazilians to victimized individuals by failing to indicate their crucial role in the construction of the Brazilian nation.⁴¹ In the Museu da Cidade the presentation of slave life is limited to a few glass displays containing miniatures depicting enslaved men and women performing different activities in urban and rural areas. This same approach can also be found in the Museu Histórico Nacional, although its permanent exhibition was recently revised, inscribing the Luso-Brazilian slave trade in the international context. Despite the increasing number of local community museums created all over the country through the initiative of Afro-Brazilian communities to promote Brazilian black history, these young institutions are not engaged in constructing an alternative narrative of Brazilian slavery. Lacking the appropriate resources to survive, they remain unstable and have to keep their focus on the development of educational activities such as workshops of Afro-Brazilian dance, music, arts and cuisine.

Brazilian Sites of Slavery

Over the last twenty years, several archaeological sites of slavery have been discovered in Rio de Janeiro's Gamboa neighbourhood. In 1996, an excavation in a private property at 36 Pedro Ernesto Street (former Cemitério Street) revealed

a burial ground containing bone fragments of dozens of African enslaved men, women and children. Known as Cemitério dos Pretos Novos, during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries thousands of African men, women and children were buried in this site which was situated close to the Valongo wharf and slave market, where from 1780 to 1831 thousands of enslaved Africans disembarked when the Atlantic slave trade was still legal in Brazil, and where the largest Rio de Janeiro slave market was located between 1818 and 1830.⁴² On 1 May 1823, the British traveller Maria Graham visited Valongo slave market. Graham provided a detailed description of the site and the conditions of the newly arrived Africans:

I have this day seen the Val Longo; it is the slave-market of Rio. Almost every house in this very long street is a depôt for slaves. On passing by the doors this evening, I saw in most of them long benches placed near the walls, on which rows of young creatures were sitting, their heads shaved, their bodies emaciated, and the marks of recent itch upon their skins. In some places the poor creatures were lying on mats, evidently too sick to sit up. At one house the half-doors were shut, and a group of boys and girls, apparently not above fifteen years old, and some much under, were leaning over the hatches, and gazing into the street with wondering faces.⁴³

Robert Walsh (1772–1852), an Irish clergyman and historian, who went to Brazil in 1828, where he spent 200 days investigating the living and working conditions of the enslaved population, also described Valongo slave market situated in Valongo Street:

The place where the great slave mart is held, is a long winding street called the Valongo which runs from the sea, at the northern extremity of the city. Almost every house in this place is a large ware-room where the slaves are deposited, and customers go to purchase. These ware-rooms stand at each side of the street, and the poor creatures are exposed for sale like any other commodity ... There was no circumstance which struck me with more melancholy reflections than this market, which I felt a kind of morbid curiosity in seeing, as a man looks at objects which excite his strongest interests, while they shock his best feelings. The ware-rooms are spacious apartments, where sometimes three or four hundred slaves, of all ages, and both sexes, are exhibited together. Round the room are benches on which the elder is generally sit, and the middle is occupied by the younger, particularly females, who squat on the ground stowed close together, with their hands and chins resting on their knees. Their only covering is a small girdle of cross-barred cotton, tied round the waist.⁴⁴

French artist Jean-Baptiste Debret (1768–1848), in his *Voyage pittoresque et historique au Brésil* (1834–5), also described the market and one of its ware-rooms. Debret's description in the text accompanying his lithograph 'Boutique de la Rue Val-Longo' clearly corresponds to the accounts provided by Graham and Walsh.⁴⁵ Between 1824 and 1830 alone – before the Cemetery of Pretos Novos was closed because of the official ban on the Brazilian slave trade – more than 6,000 newly arrived Africans were buried at the site.⁴⁶

Despite the numerous descriptions of the Valongo slave market in travel accounts, the exact location of the Valongo wharf remained lost for over a century. Actually, in 1843, the wharf underwent major works and was renamed 'Empress Wharf' to receive the Empress Teresa Cristina who arrived in Brazil that same year to marry the Brazilian emperor, Dom Pedro II. As Jaime Rodrigues points out, the renovation and the new name given to the wharf were intended to conceal the slave past of the site, replacing it with a celebratory memory of Brazilian monarchy. In March 2011, as part of the project 'Rio de Janeiro: Porto Maravilha' (Rio de Janeiro: Wonderful Port) aiming at recuperating the city's old port especially in view of the 2014 Fifa World Cup and 2016 Olympic Games, drainage works were undertaken in the region.⁴⁷ At this point the ruins of Valongo wharf, which had been totally hidden first by the granite blocks of the Empress Wharf, then by an embankment built during the major urban reform led by Mayor Pereira Passos in the early 1900s, and finally by the Avenue Barão de Tefé, were finally uncovered. The excavations also recovered numerous African artefacts, including ceramic pipes, cowries employed in religious practices and buttons made of animal bones. The mayor of Rio de Janeiro Eduardo Paes reacted to the discovery by stating that the ruins of Valongo quay are 'our Roman ruins', and promising that a memorial to exhibit the findings would be created in the Valongo garden at Morro da Conceição, in the port zone.⁴⁸

Conclusion

Afro-Brazilian demands for civil rights have led to different forms of cultural assertion that helped to promote the connections between Brazil and Africa. However, these celebrations have often concealed the origins and the causes of African forced migration to Brazil. A close examination of the initiatives to commemorate Brazilian slavery through monuments, museums and memorials indicates that the country is far behind several other nations in Africa, Europe and the Americas, which since the 1990s have started publicly acknowledging their role in the Atlantic slave trade and slavery.

Until the 1980s, the public narratives on Brazilian slavery conveyed especially during Carnival tended to support the ideology of racial democracy. With the end of the military dictatorship in 1985, these narratives have changed. Instead of emphasizing victimhood, public celebrations and official commemorations gradually started underscoring resistance, by emphasizing the memory of Zumbi and other Afro-Brazilian historical actors who fought for freedom. Despite these changes, very few Brazilian museums dedicate any space to slavery in permanent and temporary exhibitions, and even then it is usually restricted to one or two rooms. Slavery is presented as part of the history of labour, very

often through images from nineteenth-century European travel accounts and miniatures depicting scenes of work and physical punishment. This widespread superficial approach focusing on victimization and victimhood, constantly associating the Afro-Brazilian population with a negative image, prevents the understanding of slavery as a historical and contemporary phenomenon, as well as its legacies of racism and social inequalities. Despite the persistent obstacles in creating permanent public places dedicated to slavery, the growing number of international initiatives is contributing to the slow incorporation of slavery into Brazilian public space, through initiatives such as monuments, memorials and museums. Moreover, because Brazil will host important international events (2014 Fifa World Cup and 2016 Olympic Games) in the next few years, bringing slavery into the public space may become a financially viable prospect in developing cultural tourism in some regions of the country.

9 LEARNING TO REMEMBER AND IMAGINE SLAVERY: THE PEDAGOGIES OF MUSEUM FIELD TRIPS IN THE REPRESENTATION OF 'DIFFICULT' HISTORIES

Nikki Spalding

The prevailing rhetoric of remembering and teaching difficult histories, such as the Holocaust or transatlantic slavery, is one of 'never again': learning centres on remembering the past so that such atrocities will not happen in future generations. In order to understand the intergenerational transmission of memories of slavery through education, this chapter focuses on the museum as a key cultural and educational medium. It explores the potential value of drama, performance and role play in the experiences of school pupils learning to remember and imagine slavery through field trips. The issue of how museums can facilitate new forms of learning and experience which differ from other more conventional modes of educating people about the past is investigated through the analysis of qualitative data; this is not an area to which much consideration has been given in the existing literature of teaching slavery.

The rhetoric and pedagogies of difficult history education are particularly interesting in the context of periods of heightened commemorative activity, such as the 2007 bicentenary of the abolition of the British slave trade, an overview of which is given in the first section of this chapter. The significance of the activity around the bicentenary in contributing to more reflexive and critical teaching of the history of the British Empire in schools is arguably one of the most notable achievements of the commemorative year. Furthermore, at conferences and workshops around the time of the bicentenary, the educational potential of museums was frequently at the centre of discussions highlighting the conflation of learning, commemoration and difficult histories within the discursive practices of academia and the heritage and education sectors.¹ Difficult histories here are akin to S. Macdonald's understanding of 'difficult heritage', which she defines as 'a past that is recognized as meaningful in the present but that is also contested and awkward for public reconciliation with a positive, self-affirming contemporary identity'.²

- 'Visualizing Roots and Itineraries of Indian Ocean Creolizations: Project for a Museum of the Present', *Transforming Cultures eJournal*, 3:2 (2008), available at <http://epress.lib.uts.edu.au/journals/index.php/TfC/article/viewArticle/927> [accessed 17 April 2012]. See also L. Medea, 'Creolisation and Globalisation in a Neo-Colonial Context: The Case of Réunion', *Social Identities*, 8:1 (2002), pp. 125–41.
32. Vergès, 'Esclavage colonial', p. 155. Vergès prefers the term 'conflict', seeing the memorialization of slavery as a site at which the interests of various groups intersect: those who see the memories of slavery as an impediment to consideration of contemporary issues; those who see the harnessing of such memories as a means of creating social action; and those for whom the writing of national and global history is unthinkable without factoring in the slave trade.
 33. Marshall, *The French Atlantic*, p. 26.
 34. On the memorial, see J. Bonder, 'On Memory, Trauma, Public Space, Monuments and Memorials', *Places*, 12:1 (2009), pp. 61–9.
 35. See M. Rothberg, *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009).
 36. On this approach, see C. Oppel, '(Re)Writing 20th Century Slavery: Michelle Maillat's *L'Étoile noire*', in C. Baker and J. Jahn (eds), *Postcolonial Slavery: An Overview of Colonialism's Legacy* (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2008), pp. 86–105.
 37. See L. Dubois, 'Solitude's Statue: Confronting the Past in the French Caribbean', *Outre-Mers*, 350–1 (2006), pp. 27–38, on p. 29.
 38. For a translation of the speech from 30 January 2006, see <http://www.ambafrance-uk.org/Speech-by-M-Jacques-Chirac,6848.html> [accessed 5 June 2011].
 39. Larcher, 'L'esclavage colonial', p. 162.
 40. Vergès, *La Mémoire enchaînée*, p. 35.
 41. CPME, 'Mémoires de la traite négrière, de l'esclavage et de leurs abolitions', p. 28.
 42. See the discussion above of Toussaint's pantheonization as well as that of Rouch's bicentennial film.
 43. See E. Glissant, *Mémoires des esclavages: la fondation d'un centre national pour la mémoire des esclavages et de leurs abolitions* (Paris: Gallimard; La Documentation française, 2007). Glissant's poetry, novels and essays engaged with questions of slavery from the publication of his earliest work in the 1950s. In the final decade of his life, he became particularly involved in the politics of commemoration of slavery. In March 1998, he signed – with Wole Soyinka and Patrick Chamoiseau – a declaration demanding recognition of slavery as a crime against humanity, a proposal subsequently reflected in the 2001 Taubira law. In 2006, he accepted an invitation from Jacques Chirac to chair a working party that studied the practicalities of inaugurating a national centre devoted to the slave trade, slavery and their abolition. Although Chris Bongie identifies clear evidence of bad faith in Glissant's acceptance of a French government invitation to become a 'fonctionnaire de la mémoire' [civil servant of memory] engaged in the official politics of slavery and commemoration, the resulting report published the following year is a manifesto on the commemoration of slavery whose radical recommendations are yet to be implemented. See C. Bongie, *Friends and Enemies: The Scribal Politics of Post/Colonial Literature* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2008), and C. Forsdick, 'Late Glissant: History, "World Literature", and the Persistence of the Political', *Small Axe*, 14:3 (2010), pp. 121–34.
 44. See Bongie, *Friends and Enemies: The Scribal Politics of Post/Colonial Literature*.
 45. See Glissant, *Mémoires des esclavages*, p. 34. On the need to understand the French and Francophone histories and memories of slavery transnationally, see L. Dubois, 'Histoires d'esclavage en France et aux États-Unis', *Esprit*, 332 (2007), pp. 71–80.

46. On the links between the Haitian Revolution and revolutionary activity elsewhere in the francophone Caribbean, see L. Dubois, *A Colony of Citizens: Revolution and Slave Emancipation in the French Caribbean, 1787–1804* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2004). On the place of Haiti in Martinican culture, see J.-M. Salien, 'Haïti vue de la Martinique', *French Review*, 77:6 (2004), pp. 1166–80.
47. It is significant that a subsequent anthology produced by Glissant to mark the 10 May commemorations contains contributions from a range of language traditions, and firmly asserts the transnational dimensions of the memorialization of slavery. See *10 Mai: mémoires de la traite négrière, de l'esclavage et de leurs abolitions* (Paris: Galaade, 2010).
48. E. Glissant, 'Mémoire des esclaves: tous les jours de mai 2008' (May 2008), at <http://www.hommes-et-faits.com/Dial/spip.php?article118> [accessed 5 June 2011]. On the question of 'colonial repentance', see C. Barbier and E. Mandonnet, 'Colonisation: le mal de la repentance', *L'Express*, 15 December 2005. Françoise Vergès is insistent that the emphasis in her own work is not on repentance but on a 'request for historical inscription'. See 'Esclavage colonial', p. 165.

8 Araújo, 'Public Memory of Slavery in Brazil'

1. D. Eltis et al., *The Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade Database: Voyages*, at <http://www.slavevoyages.org> [accessed 5 August 2011].
2. Few book-length studies have focused on the public memory of slavery beyond national spaces. On the United States, see J. O. Horton and L. E. Horton (eds), *Slavery And Public History: The Tough Stuff of American Memory* (New York: New Press, 2006); on Ghana, see B. Holsey, *Routes of Remembrance: Refashioning the Slave Trade in Ghana* (Chicago, IL: Chicago University Press, 2008); on Brazil and the Bight of Benin, see A. L. Araújo, *Public Memory of Slavery: Victims and Perpetrators in the South Atlantic* (Amherst, NY: Cambria Press, 2010). Edited books include A. L. Araújo (ed.), *Living History: Encountering the Memory of the Heirs of Slavery* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2009); L. Smith, G. Cubitt, R. Wilson and K. Fouseki (eds), *Representing Enslavement and Abolition in Museums* (New York and London: Routledge, 2011); and A. L. Araújo (ed.), *Politics of Memory: Making Slavery Visible in the Public Space* (New York and London: Routledge, 2012).
3. The bibliography on Brazilian slavery is vast. For a recent survey on Brazilian slavery published in English, see H. S. Klein and F. V. Luna, *Slavery in Brazil* (Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press, 2010). See R. de B. Marques, 'A dinâmica da escravidão no Brasil: resistência, tráfico negreiro e alforrias, séculos XVII a XIX', *Novos Estudos*, 74 (2006), pp. 107–23.
4. See Eltis et al., *The Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade Database*, at <http://www.slavevoyages.org> [accessed 5 August 2011].
5. R. Conrad, *The Destruction of Brazilian Slavery, 1850–1888* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1972), p. 274.
6. It would be impossible to cite the large literature on Brazilian whitening policies. See M. Corrêa, *Ilusões da liberdade: a escola Nina Rodrigues e a antropologia no Brasil* (Bragança Paulista: UDUSF, 1998) and L. M. Schwarcz, *O espetáculo das raças: cientistas, instituições e questões raciais no Brasil* (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1993). More recently, see A. A. Romo, *Brazil's Living Museum: Race, Reform, and Tradition in Bahia* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2010).

7. See among others T. H. Holloway, *Immigrants on the Land: Coffee and Society in São Paulo, 1886–1934* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1980).
8. On the idea of racial harmony, see G. Freyre, *Casa-grande & senzala* (1933; Rio de Janeiro: Global, 2003). On the myth of the three races see L. M. Schwarcz, 'Le complexe de Zé Carioca: notes sur une certaine identité métisse et malandra', *Lusotopie* (1997), p. 253 and Araujo, *Public Memory of Slavery*, p. 213.
9. See A. S. A. Guimarães, *Racismo and anti-racismo no Brasil* (São Paulo: Editora 34, 1999), p. 62; A. S. A. Guimarães, 'Depois da democracia racial', *Tempo Social. Revista de Sociologia da USP*, 18:2 (2006), pp. 269–87, on p. 269.
10. See UNESCO, 'The Race Question' (Paris: UNESCO, 1950) and Alfred Métraux, 'Une enquête sur les relations raciales au Brésil', in *Le Courrier*, Publication de l'Organisation des Nations Unies pour l'Éducation, la Science et la Culture 8–9 (August–September, 1952), p. 6.
11. R. Bastide and F. Fernandes, *Branços e negros em São Paulo; ensaio sociológico sobre aspectos da formação, manifestações atuais e efeitos do preconceito de cor na sociedade paulistana* (São Paulo: Companhia Editora Nacional, 1959).
12. See F. Fernandes, *A integração do negro na sociedade de classes* (São Paulo: Cia Editora Nacional, 1965). See also F. H. Cardoso, *Capitalismo e escravidão no Brasil meridional: o negro na sociedade escravocrata do Rio Grande do Sul* (São Paulo: Difusão Européia do Livro, 1962). Anani Dzidziyeno was the first African American sociologist to discuss racism in Brazil. See A. Dzidziyeno, *The Position of Blacks in Brazilian Society* (London: Minority Rights Group, 1971), and A. S. A. Guimarães, 'Preconceito de cor e racismo no Brasil', *Revista de Antropologia*, 47:1 (2004), pp. 9–43, on p. 25.
13. For example, since 1983 the Brazilian black movement has celebrated the anniversary of the death of Zumbi, the leader of the largest and most enduring Brazilian runaway slave community, located in the then province of Pernambuco (modern state of Alagoas), who was assassinated by the Portuguese in November 1695. The new Brazilian constitution of 1988 established for the first time that racism was a crime. In addition Article 68 of the Act of the Transitory Constitutional Disposals law established that remnants of *quilombo* communities had the right to ownership of land they occupied. Also in 1988, the Fundação Cultural Palmares (Palmares Cultural Foundation) was created to promote and preserve black heritage in Brazilian society.
14. Candomblé is an 'Afro-Brazilian religion of divination, sacrifice, healing, music, dance and spirit possession': see J. L. Matory, *Black Atlantic Religion: Tradition, Transnationalism and Matriarchy in the Afro-Brazilian Candomblé* (Princeton, NJ and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2005), p. 1. Candomblé temples were traditionally organized according to the *orixás* (Yoruba 'deities') and 'nations' (Mina, Jeje, Nagô, Congo, Angola, etc.), usually associated with the broad region of embarkation of enslaved Africans. See also S. Capone, *Searching for Africa in Brazil: Power and Tradition in Candomblé* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010) and L. N. Parés, *A Formação do Candomblé – História e Ritual da Nação Jeje na Bahia* (Campinas: Editora da Universidade Estadual de São Paulo, 2007). On how slavery is embodied in dance and ritual see R. Shaw, *Memories of the Slave Trade: Ritual and the Historical Imagination in Sierra Leone* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2002) and A. Brivio, 'Foreign Vodun: Memories of Slavery and Colonial Encounter in Togo and Benin', in Araujo (ed.), *Living History*, pp. 245–68.
15. See the Slave Route project, at http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=25659&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html [accessed 5 August 2011].

16. See A. L. Araujo, 'Gender, Sex and Power: Images of the Enslaved Women's Bodies', in G. Campbell and E. Elbourne (eds), *Sexuality and Slavery: The Carnal Dynamics of Enslavement* (Athens, OH: Ohio University Press, forthcoming).
17. On Museu do Negro, see M. Wood, 'The Museu do Negro in Rio and the Cult of Anastácia as a New Model for the Memory of Slavery', *Representations*, 113 (2011), pp. 111–49. On the Monument to Mãe Preta, see P. Alberto, *Terms of Inclusion: Black Intellectuals in Twentieth-Century Brazil* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2011), pp. 209–11.
18. See W. R. de Albuquerque, 'Esperanças de Boaventuras: Construções da África e Africanismos na Bahia (1887–1910)', *Estudos Afro-Asiáticos*, 24:2 (2002), pp. 215–45 and A. L. Araujo, 'Slavery, Royalty and Racism: Representations of Africa in Brazilian Carnival', *Ethnologies*, 31:2 (2010), pp. 131–67.
19. J. N. Green, *Beyond Carnival. Male Homosexuality in Twentieth-Century Brazil* (Chicago, IL: Chicago University Press, 2001), p. 27.
20. For a more detailed analysis of these samba lyrics see Araujo, *Public Memory of Slavery*, ch. 5.
21. See J. F. Furtado, *Chica da Silva: A Brazilian Slave of the Eighteenth Century* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
22. See E. França Paiva, 'Reviewing the Paradigms of Social Relations in Brazilian Slavery in Eighteenth-Century Minas Gerais', in Araujo (ed.), *Living History*, pp. 231–44.
23. Lyrics of 'Do Yorubá à luz, a aurora dos deuses', by Renato de Verdade, interpreted by Rico Medeiros.
24. See M. Agier, *Anthropologie du carnaval: la ville, la fête et l'Afrique à Bahia* (Marseille: Parenthèses/IRD, 2000).
25. On the idea conveyed by Brazilian black movement that the Golden Law did not abolish slavery, see A. L. Araujo and F. Saillant, 'L'esclavage au Brésil: le travail du mouvement noir', *Ethnologie Française*, 37:3 (2007), pp. 457–66, on p. 463 and H. Mattos and A. L. Rios, *Memórias do cativo: família, trabalho e cidadania no pós-abolição* (Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira 2005), p. 290.
26. See B. Guimarães, *A Escrava Isaura* (Rio de Janeiro: Casa Garnier, 1875).
27. The scenes depicted in the watercolours were also reproduced in the lithographs published in his album. J-B. Debret, *Voyage pittoresque et historique au Brésil* (Paris: Firmin-Didot Frères, 1834–9). The opening of the telenovela *A Escrava Isaura* (1976) is available on YouTube at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=c7XpRLtc9w0> [accessed 5 August 2011].
28. L. Smith, *Uses of Heritage* (London and New York: Routledge, 2006), p. 44.
29. M. K. Smith, *Issues in Cultural Tourism Studies* (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), p. 79. *Jongo* is an Afro-Brazilian dance and musical practice, found particularly in the Brazilian South East region. For more information, see S. H. Lara and G. Pacheco (eds), *Memória do Jongo: As Gravações Históricas de Stanley J. Stein: Vassouras 1949* (Rio de Janeiro: Edições Folha Seca, 2007) and the documentary *Jongo, Calangos e Folias: Música Negra, Memória e Poesia* (2008), by H. Mattos and M. Abreu, at <http://ufftube.uff.br/video/9RBAHO8O6474/Jongos-Calangos-e-Folias-M%C3%BAlica-Negra-Mem%C3%B3ria-e-Poesia> [accessed 5 August 2011]. On 'playing stick' see the documentary *Versos e Cacetes: O Jogo do pau na cultura afro-fluminense* (2007) by M. R. Assunção and H. Mattos, at <http://ufftube.uff.br/video/G2SY2DSB1KSS/Versos-e-Cacetes-O-jogo-do-pau-na-cultura-afro-fluminense> [accessed 15 August 2011]. On

- capoeira, see M. R. Assunção, *Capoeira: The History of an Afro-Brazilian Martial Art* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002).
30. See Araujo, 'Slavery, Royalty and Racism', pp. 131–67.
 31. See in particular the work developed by historian Hebe Mattos and her team in the LABHOI (Laboratório de História Oral e Imagem) of Federal Fluminense University in Rio de Janeiro, at <http://www.historia.uff.br/labhoi/> [accessed 5 August 2011].
 32. For more details of the controversies related to the construction of the monument see M. de C. Soares, 'Nos atalhos da memória: monumento a Zumbi', in P. Knauss (ed.), *Cidade vaidosa: imagens urbanas do Rio de Janeiro* (Rio de Janeiro: Sette Letras, 1999), pp. 117–35, on p. 129.
 33. Author's translation of 'Zumbi, o líder negro de todas as raças'.
 34. Tancredo Neves (1910–85) was one of the leaders of the Brazilian political reformist movement *Diretas Já*.
 35. ICOMOS, World Heritage List number 309, 28 December 1983.
 36. Author's free translation of 'Martir do movimento revolucionário de 1798, intitulado Conspiração dos Búzios, Revolta dos Alfaiates ou Conjuração Baiana, defendeu a causa da independência do Brasil, da proclamação da república, da abolição da escravidão e dos direitos iguais para todos os cidadãos.'
 37. Author's free translation of 'Zumbi dos Palmares líder da primeira experiência democrática do país. O monumento de Zumbi dos Palmares é o símbolo da resistência do povo negro brasileiro e a materialização da memória de lutas e conquistas pelo exercício da liberdade no fortalecimento pela consciência negra.'
 38. Author's free translation of 'Zumbi dos Palmares. É chegada a hora de tirar nossa nação das trevas da injustiça racial. Nasceu livre, em 1655, na Serra da Barriga, União dos Palmares, Alagoas. Neto de Aqualtune, não permitiu a submissão de seu povo ao jugo da coroa portuguesa, pois queria a liberdade para todos, dentro ou fora do quilombo. Persistiu na luta e tornou-se líder do quilombo, sendo ferido em 1694, quando a capital Palmares foi destruída. Em 20 de novembro de 1695, foi morto e decapitado. Após 300 anos, a data da morte desse líder da resistência negra foi instituída, pelo movimento negro, como Dia Nacional da Consciência Negra.'
 39. See K. Cleveland, 'The Art of Memory: São Paulo's AfroBrazil Museum', in Araujo (ed.), *Politics of Memory*, pp. 197–212.
 40. For example, the Museu da Inconfidência (Ouro Preto, Minas Gerais), the Museu do Escravo (Belo Vale, Minas Gerais), the Museu de Artes e Ofícios (Belo Horizonte, Minas Gerais), the Museu Imperial de Petrópolis (Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro), the Museu Histórico Nacional (Rio de Janeiro), the Museu do Negro (Rio de Janeiro), the Museu da Cidade (Salvador, Bahia), the Museu Náutico da Bahia and the Museu Júlio de Castilhos (Porto Alegre, Rio Grande do Sul).
 41. On the images and narratives that emphasize the suffering of the Brazilian black population see M. S. dos Santos, 'The Repressed Memory of Brazilian Slavery', *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 11:2 (2008), pp. 157–75.
 42. J. Rodrigues, *De Costa a Costa: Escravos, marinheiros e intermediários do tráfico negreiro de Angola ao Rio de Janeiro (1780–1860)* (São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2005), pp. 298–9.
 43. M. [Graham] Callcot, *Journal of a Voyage to Brazil, and Residence there during 1821, 1822, 1823* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green et al., 1824), Project Gutenberg, at <http://www.gutenberg.org/etext/21201> [accessed 5 August 2011].

44. R. Walsh, *Notices of Brazil in 1828 and 1829* (London: F. Westley & A. H. Davis, 1830), pp. 323–4.
45. Debret, *Voyage pittoresque et historique au Brésil*, vol. 2, plate 23.
46. On the cemetery of Pretos Novos, see Portal Arqueológico dos Pretos Novos, <http://www.pretosnovos.com.br/> [accessed 5 August 2011]. See also the documentary *Memories on the Edge of Oblivion* (2010), by A. Cicalo, at <http://www.socialsciences.manchester.ac.uk/disciplines/socialanthropology/visualanthropology/archive/phdm-phil/> [accessed 5 August 2011].
47. See Rio de Janeiro: Porto Maravilha, at <http://www.portomaravilhario.com.br/> [accessed 5 August 2011]. A video on the project is available at <http://vimeo.com/8096894> [accessed 5 August 2011].
48. R. Daflon, 'Ruínas nos Subterrâneos do Porto Maravilha: Escavações de obra de drenagem da Zona Portuária encontram restos do cais da Imperatriz e do Valongo', *O Globo*, online edition, 1 March 2011, at <http://oglobo.globo.com/rio/mat/2011/03/01/escavacoes-de-obra-de-drenagem-da-zona-portuaria-encontram-restos-dos-cais-da-imperatriz-do-valongo-923909746.asp> [accessed 5 August 2011].

9 Spalding, 'Learning to Remember and Imagine Slavery'

1. S. Mack, 'Black Voices and Absences in the Commemorations of Abolition in North East England', *Slavery and Abolition*, 30:2 (2009), pp. 247–57; L. Smith, '“Man's Inhumanity to Man” and other Platitudes of Avoidance and Misrecognition: An Analysis of Visitor Responses to Exhibitions Marking the 1807 Bicentenary', *Museum and Society*, 8:3 (2010), pp. 193–213, on p. 193.
2. S. Macdonald, *Difficult Heritage: Negotiating the Nazi Past in Nuremberg and Beyond* (New York: Routledge, 2009), p. 1.
3. Responses to all surveys are on file with the author.
4. A. Landsberg, *Prosthetic Memory* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004).
5. E. Kowaleski-Wallace, *The British Slave Trade and Public Memory* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2006); L. Smith, G. Cubitt, G. Fouseki and R. Wilson, *Representing Enslavement and Abolition in Museums: Ambiguous Engagements* (New York: Routledge, 2011); A. Tibbles, 'Facing Slavery's Past: The Bicentenary of the Abolition of the British Slave Trade', *Slavery and Abolition*, 29:2 (2008), pp. 293–303.
6. Directgov, 'Slavery Bicentenary', at <http://www.direct.gov.uk/en/slavery/index.htm> [accessed 19 April 2010].
7. D. Hamilton, 'Representing Slavery in British Museums: The Challenges of 2007', in C. Kaplan and J. Oldfield (eds), *Imagining Transatlantic Slavery* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 127–144; K. Prior, 'Remembering 1807: Histories of the Slave Trade, Slavery and Abolition', *History Workshop Journal*, 64:1 (2007), pp. 200–10.
8. Understanding Slavery Initiative, 'Understanding Slavery', at <http://www.understandingslavery.com/> [accessed 8 December 2007].
9. Understanding Slavery Initiative, *Unlocking Perceptions* (London: Understanding Slavery Initiative, 2008).
10. E. Hooper-Greenhill, *The Educational Role of the Museum* (London: Routledge, 1999), p. 255.
11. Department for Education and Skills, *Learning Outside the Classroom Manifesto* (Nottingham: DFES Publications, 2006).